
Fwd: Major Revisions requested REVI-D-22-00044R1

5 messages

Selar Othman Ali <selar.ali@epu.edu.iq>
To: Abdullah Omar Yassen <abdullah.yassen@epu.edu.iq>

5 December 2022 at 16:26

Hello Abdullah,

Hope all is well with you. This is the IRE response on RVI. Submission deadline is 16 Jan.

Kind regards,
Selar

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **International Review of Education (REVI)** <em@editorialmanager.com>
Date: Mon, 5 Dec 2022 at 2:35 PM
Subject: Major Revisions requested REVI-D-22-00044R1
To: Selar Othman Ali <selar.ali@epu.edu.iq>

Dear Mrs Ali,

We have received the reports from our blind peer reviewers on your manuscript, REVI-D-22-00044R1 "Informal and Non-formal Education for Migrants and Refugees in Iraq: A Proposal for Policy Development", which you submitted to International Review of Education.

Based on the advice received, I feel that your manuscript could be reconsidered for publication should you be prepared to incorporate major revisions.

When preparing your revised manuscript, you are asked to carefully consider the reviewers comments, and submit a list of responses to the comments.

Please contact me if you are unclear about any of the reviewers' recommendations. You are kindly requested to also check the website for possible reviewer attachment(s).

Please make sure to submit your editable source files (i. e. Word, TeX).

In order to submit your revised manuscript, please log on to the Journal's website.

Your username is: Selar

If you forgot your password, you can click the 'Send Login Details' link on the EM Login page at <https://www.editorialmanager.com/revi/>.

We look forward to receiving your revised manuscript before 16 Jan 2023.

Thank you very much.

With kind regards,
Paul Stanistreet
Executive Editor

International Review of Education - Journal of Lifelong Learning

COMMENTS TO THE AUTHOR:

Reviewer #1: I don't recommend this article for publication at the present time. This reads more like an encyclopedic entry that summarizes some of the issues that Iraq's formal education system is struggling with, including in the uneven provenance of educational opportunities for students who have experienced displacement. However, multiple issues and questions came up during this review:

Page 4:

- 1) The abstract must make clear the connections between educational loss for displaced people, the lack of recognition of non-formal and informal learning, and employment and life outcomes for displaced people (this is written as three distinct paragraphs).
- 2) What is the relationship between (internal) displacement and landless minorities like Kurdish people? Cause, effect, histories of marginalization? How do the employment challenges of young people in Kurdistan relate to issues of displacement and adult learning? Where do refugees and migrants come in?
- 3) Why were these people interviewed? what were they asked? What does "lack of digitalization and documentation" mean? in terms of what?

Page 6-:

- 1) is this a distinct form of displacement, that of Syrian refugees? who are the displaced people you are talking about- Kurdish people, Syrian refugees, both?
- 2) The author uses "most" and other general quantifiers, which come across as anecdotal and ungrounded. The issue of making claims that seem speculative is a major issue with this paper.
- 3) ** Logic question: If the government doesn't have the jobs/money to offer work to people who are displaced, even if they have qualifications, then how can we argue that creating mechanisms for recognizing non-formal and informal qualifications alleviate these struggles? see quote: "even those with university qualifications demanding the government to be employed, rightly or wrongly, the government no longer has the capacity to employ the graduates"
- 4) How would IDPs cause an "influx" if they are in the country already? Who are IDPs? Are they Kurdish?
- 5) Define terms: IDP, displaced people, etc. in the context of Iraq

Page 7:

- 1) Methodology is incomplete:
 - research design overall?
 - sampling? and setting?
 - data collection methods?
 - analysis?
- 2) The question you ask—how these programs "ENCOURAGE the vulnerable in society to continue learning" is different than asking what impact they have on employment. Also, to whom are you referring when you mention "the vulnerable"?
- 3) Unclear how the author can make the following claim: "These programmes, if successfully implemented, will undoubtedly lower the unemployment rate, reduce poverty, widen the occupational sphere and benefit the society. The programmes also can reduce the tension among the displaced and local community and creates inclusive society that allows refugees and migrants to fully integrate with the host society through accessing education and training programmes." How do IDPs figure in here? How can you assert that inclusion in non-formal or informal learning will ensure employment for these people? what about other structural barriers based on language, racial/ethnic prejudice, different educational experiences in home countries, and so on?

More comments:

- 1) How would the interviewees' insights offer in starting to answer some of the questions you're asking?
- 2) Section 3 and following sections should be placed before Methodology and truncated
- 3) is this somewhat in contradiction to this statement from a previous page?: "For countries that are facing conflict and displacement, formal education by itself would not be sufficient to address the quality of learning because their predicament means that thousands and millions will miss out on formal education."
- 4) Contradictory statements: Author states on p. 8: "Refugees and IDPs have access to education and employment same as the local community"; however, on p. 9 the author writes, "In order for a refugee to access education in Iraq, their qualification has to be certified by their Ministry of Education and foreign office. If these two authorities have not certified the qualification, the applicant would not be able to access education."
- 5) What about IDPs who are/speak Kurdish?
- 6) What is the relevance of the chart on p. 9?

The rest of the paper is very informative. However, as this is meant to be an empirical article in the social sciences, it needs to be reorganized in addition to responding to the questions mentioned above here.

Reviewer #2: The topic is important and it is clear that the author(s) has / have made quite an effort. This said, the article seems to be more descriptive than analytical. It seems rather like a book chapter, which gives an overview of the state of non-formal education in Iraq than a journal article with (a) clear question(s), presentation of the data and an analysis. The empirical data are, apparently, interspersed throughout the article. In its current form, I am not sure that this should be published in the Review, but I would support after revisions. Some proofreading / editing is necessary.

Substantively, I don't think that a framework for informal learning is possible or even desirable (this is different from non-formal education).

Some more specific comments:

Abstract: describes background, but not the thrust of research.

P. 5: chef is, to my knowledge, not part of university education anywhere. Is there no TVET in Iraq (but mentioned on pp. 7 and 12)? Otherwise, issue is not completely clear.

P. 6: demand side seems not to be considered.

P. 8: why no references to ISCED?

P. 12: what is meant with 'lack of support from international organisations'? It is not usual for UNESCO to fund direct education service delivery.

P. 14: unusual to mention officials directly.

There is additional documentation related to this decision letter. To access the file(s), please click the link below. You may also login to the system and click the 'View Attachments' link in the Action column.

<https://www.editorialmanager.com/revi/l.asp?i=64863&l=HLEEA81F>

Please note that this journal is a Transformative Journal (TJ). Authors may publish their research with us through the traditional subscription access route or make their paper immediately open access through payment of an article-processing charge (APC). Authors will not be required to make a final decision about access to their article until it has been accepted.

Authors may need to take specific actions to achieve compliance with funder and institutional open access mandates. If your research is supported by a funder that requires immediate open access (e.g. according to Plan S principles) then you should select the gold OA route, and we will direct you to the compliant route where possible. For authors selecting the subscription publication route our standard licensing terms will need to be accepted, including our self-archiving policies. Those standard licensing terms will supersede any other terms that the author or any third party may assert apply to any version of the manuscript.

<a href= <https://www.springernature.com/gp/open-research/funding/policy-compliance-faqs>> Find out more about compliance

This letter contains confidential information, is for your own use, and should not be forwarded to third parties.

Recipients of this email are registered users within the Editorial Manager database for this journal. We will keep your information on file to use in the process of submitting, evaluating and publishing a manuscript. For more information on how we use your personal details please see our privacy policy at <https://www.springernature.com/production-privacy-policy>. If you no longer wish to receive messages from this journal or you have questions regarding database management, please contact the Publication Office at the link below.

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/revi/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

--

.....
Mrs. Selar Othman Ali

PhD in Education (Reform Policy and QA in Higher Education), Southampton University, UK

Master's in Education (Effective teamwork in Higher Education), Nottingham University, UK

BA in English Language, University of Salahaddin, Kurdistan Region, Iraq